

STATE OF NEW YORK  
COUNTY OF DUTCHESS

-----X  
DUTCHESS COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT  
AGENCY RE:

HATFIELD PROPERTIES, LLC and  
HATFIELD METAL FAB, INC.

-----X

DATE: November 10, 2020  
10:32 a.m. - 10:42 a.m.

Frances M. Elmes, Reporter

MINUTES OF PUBLIC HEARING  
CONDUCTED BY REMOTE VIDEOCONFERENCE

MARY T. BABIARZ COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.  
(845) 471-2511

1 APPEARING BY REMOTE VIDEO CONFERENCE:

2 DONALD CAPPILLINO, Hearing Officer  
3 CAPPILLINO & ROTHSCHILD, LLP  
4 Seven Broad Street  
5 P.O. Box 390  
6 Pawling, New York 12564  
7 E-mail: Dc@cappillino.com

8 SARAH LEE, CFO, Think Dutchess Alliance  
9 for Business  
10 3 Neptune Avenue  
11 Poughkeepsie, New York 12601  
12 E-mail: Sarah@thinkdutchess.com

13 VINCENT CATALANO, ESQ.  
14 Attorney for Applicant  
15 4 Liberty Street, Second Floor  
16 Poughkeepsie, New York 12601

17 HENRY HATFIELD

18 DOREEN TIGNANELLI

19 DANIEL MOORE  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 Proceedings

2 MR. CAPPILLINO: All right. It's  
3 now 10:33, I'll open the public hearing.  
4 Before the public hearing began I had  
5 marked some documents in evidence, so  
6 they've been sent on to Frances Elmes,  
7 our court reporter. The first document  
8 marked as Hearing Officer's Exhibit 1 in  
9 evidence is the Notice of Public Hearing  
10 in this matter indicating that this  
11 public hearing will be held by a Zoom  
12 conference on November 10, 2020 at  
13 10:30 a.m. local time.

14 I had marked as Hearing Officer's  
15 Exhibit Number 2 in evidence the  
16 October 27th affidavit of a  
17 representative of the Poughkeepsie  
18 Journal indicating that the Notice of  
19 Public Hearing was published on  
20 October 27, 2020.

21 I had marked as Hearing Officer's  
22 Exhibit Number 3 in evidence the  
23 October 26, 2020 affidavit of Jenna L.  
24 Jones indicating that a copy of this  
25 Notice of Public Hearing was served upon

1 Proceedings

2 the Honorable Alan Bell, the Supervisor  
3 of the Town of LaGrange; upon Dr.  
4 Brendon Lyons, Superintendant of Schools  
5 of the Arlington Central School  
6 District; and upon Honorable Marcus J.  
7 Molinaro, Dutchess County Executive.

8 I had marked as Hearing Officer's  
9 Exhibit Number 4 in evidence the  
10 October 23, 2020 letter of Timothy Dean,  
11 Chairman of the Dutchess County  
12 Industrial Development Agency,  
13 appointing me as the hearing officer in  
14 this matter. And so with that I will  
15 now open this public hearing. I don't  
16 know whether, Vincent, you want to make  
17 a brief statement of what this project  
18 is about for the record. You're paying  
19 by the page, understand.

20 MR. CATALANO: Got it. Thanks a  
21 lot. My name is Vincent Catalano, I'm  
22 the attorney for Hatfield Metal Fab.  
23 This is a --- Hatfield Metal Fab is a  
24 metal fabrication company, they've been  
25 in business for many, many years. About

1 Proceedings

2 in 2018 they made a request before the  
3 IDA for some tax relief because they  
4 sought to expand their existing facility  
5 by adding a 30,000-square foot structure  
6 onto their --- or, I'm sorry, a  
7 50,000-square square foot structure onto  
8 their existing structure, the reason  
9 being that recently they've encountered  
10 some difficulty in obtaining new jobs.  
11 Over the years they've acquired more  
12 equipment and that's taken up the space  
13 to do the additional fabrication.

14 Most recently they were unable to  
15 bid on a job, which the IDA is familiar  
16 with, it's called the Cricket Valley  
17 Project. It would have been an ideal  
18 job for them but for the fact that they  
19 simply didn't have the necessary  
20 infrastructure to complete the job. The  
21 new facility will allow them to do jobs  
22 like this. It's going to be a taller  
23 building, it will allow them to  
24 manufacture additional items. It will  
25 add about 12 permanent jobs to the

1 Proceedings

2 facility bringing the total number of  
3 jobs at the facility to 64 permanent  
4 positions.

5 When the application was made my  
6 client didn't realize that --- when he  
7 made the application it was for the ---  
8 it was just for the metal structure  
9 itself. It did not include any of the  
10 interior fit-ups or any of the  
11 electrical work, carpentry, things of  
12 that nature. And the reason is is that  
13 he didn't realize that the sales tax  
14 that was --- that the subcontractors  
15 were going to be paying would be passed  
16 on to him. He didn't realize that they  
17 would be getting sales tax on the  
18 materials that they were providing for  
19 the project and then in turn those ---  
20 that sales tax was being passed on to  
21 him. So when he started getting  
22 estimates they were significantly higher  
23 than what he had realized.

24 And so what we've done is we've  
25 revised the estimate and there is a ---

## 1 Proceedings

2 there is an October 28, 2020 detail of  
3 the breakdown of materials and labor for  
4 this cost and then the amount of sales  
5 tax that would otherwise have to be  
6 paid. So the increase is for a sales  
7 tax exemption of \$186,542, and this is  
8 really more just a correction than  
9 anything else. There is an increase in  
10 the original estimate of construction.  
11 There has been some time that's gone by  
12 and the cost of construction, especially  
13 during this COVID crisis, has gone up  
14 significantly. So that's about what  
15 we've got and why we're making this  
16 request.

17 MR. CAPPILLINO: Okay. Thank  
18 you. Members of the public, we'll start  
19 with Doreen, can we un-mute Doreen and  
20 give her the opportunity --- understand,  
21 Doreen, we did receive an e-mail from  
22 you and from your husband, Jim Beretta,  
23 and those will be passed on to the board  
24 along with a transcript of this  
25 particular public hearing. So is there

## 1 Proceedings

2 anything additional you would like to  
3 add to this particular matter?

4 MS. TIGNANELLI: Yes, I would  
5 like to speak. Thank you. So, again,  
6 I'm opposed to the additional financial  
7 assistance for the project. And while  
8 the attorney said that --- for the  
9 project said that this is just more of a  
10 correction than anything else, I would  
11 like to say that the original exemption  
12 was only for \$16,250 and now the  
13 exemption is for 160 --- \$186,542, so I  
14 don't consider that just a minor  
15 correction.

16 And the other thing is I'm still  
17 --- you know, I still don't understand  
18 how, you know, they claim that they were  
19 --- the original application only had  
20 --- and this is their words --- the  
21 shell of the building cost. I mean, in  
22 the 2018 resolution it specifically said  
23 financial assistance was for  
24 construction, improvement,  
25 reconstruction, repair, renovation,



1 Proceedings

2 installation, furnishing and equipping  
3 of the site. So, again, I just don't  
4 understand how they can still claim that  
5 they only thought that it was for the  
6 shell of the building.

7 And I'd also like --- the numbers  
8 are all over the place in here. And,  
9 first of all, I'd just like to say the  
10 Notice of Public Hearing, that was  
11 questionable, because they refer --- it  
12 refers to a letter amendment about the  
13 additional financial assistance. It  
14 says it's dated September 28, 2020, but  
15 the Public Hearing Notice failed to  
16 state that there was a subsequent letter  
17 amendment dated October 28, 2020 that  
18 had totally different numbers than the  
19 September 28, 2020 letter amendment. So  
20 this has really been all over the place.

21 And my final comment, again, is  
22 the board should insure that the  
23 accuracy of the prior pilot  
24 calculations, if they still apply,  
25 determine if they're affected by these

## 1 Proceedings

2 changes because the total project value  
3 has changed, the total project cost. So  
4 any change to the pilot I think, you  
5 know, needs to be determined, if there  
6 are changes to the pilot. Thank you.

7 MR. CAPPILLINO: Okay. But just  
8 a clarification, the Notice of Public  
9 Hearing was sent for publication prior  
10 to the October 27th publication. At  
11 that time we were working with a figure  
12 where there would have been \$200,000 in  
13 sales tax relief sought and then as  
14 Mr. Hatfield went through and got more  
15 of his quotes in from his contractors he  
16 was able to determine that the amount  
17 would be reduced to 186,000, and so that  
18 was included in the application.

19 So the proposal before the board  
20 is for some, you know, 13, \$14,000 less  
21 than he had asked for in the  
22 September 28th matter. So I don't think  
23 we are at this point adding anything.  
24 He's actually subtracting, reducing his  
25 request, and I think the board would

## 1 Proceedings

2 always consider that to be an  
3 appropriate matter.

4 But it couldn't have been  
5 provided --- the notice couldn't have  
6 been provided in the Notice of Public  
7 Hearing because that was actually  
8 published on the 27th, the day before  
9 Mr. Hatfield was able to gather all the  
10 information and ask for this additional  
11 modification. So that's all we have.

12 So now --- and, Doreen, I guess  
13 to open the mic again for Doreen, Jim is  
14 not here, he's not --- I know that he  
15 wrote a letter, as well, and his letter  
16 will be passed on, but he's not going to  
17 be attending at this meeting?

18 MS. TIGNANELLI: He will not.  
19 Thank you for checking.

20 MR. CAPPILLINO: Okay. Thanks.  
21 And, Dan, did you have anything? I see  
22 you're listed here. Can we open Dan's  
23 mic and ask if he wants to add more, so  
24 ask him if he has anything to say?

25 MR. MOORE: I don't have

## 1 Proceedings

2 anything. Thank you.

3 MR. CAPPILLINO: Fine. Thank  
4 you. Okay. With that, I will ---  
5 nothing further, I will now close the  
6 public hearing. Thank you all for  
7 attending.

8 \*I\* \* \* \*

9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1         STATE OF NEW YORK     )  
                                  )  SS.  
2         COUNTY OF DUTCHESS  )

3  
4  
5                         REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION

6  
7                 I hereby certify that the foregoing is  
8                 a true and accurate transcript of the minutes  
9                 recorded by me and reduced to typewriting at  
10                my direction.

11  
12  
13   *Frances M. Elmes*  
14   X \_\_\_\_\_  
   FRANCES M. ELMES

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

	4:5	10:8	3:7	5:15
<b>\$</b>	<b>assistance (3)</b> 8:7,23;9:13	<b>client (1)</b> 6:6	<b>documents (1)</b> 3:5	<b>figure (1)</b> 10:11
<b>\$14,000 (1)</b> 10:20	<b>attending (2)</b> 11:17;12:7	<b>close (1)</b> 12:5	<b>done (1)</b> 6:24	<b>final (1)</b> 9:21
<b>\$16,250 (1)</b> 8:12	<b>attorney (2)</b> 4:22;8:8	<b>comment (1)</b> 9:21	<b>Doreen (5)</b> 7:19,19,21;11:12,13	<b>financial (3)</b> 8:6,23;9:13
<b>\$186,542 (2)</b> 7:7;8:13	<b>B</b>	<b>company (1)</b> 4:24	<b>Dr (1)</b> 4:3	<b>Fine (1)</b> 12:3
<b>\$200,000 (1)</b> 10:12	<b>began (1)</b> 3:4	<b>complete (1)</b> 5:20	<b>during (1)</b> 7:13	<b>first (2)</b> 3:7;9:9
<b>*</b>	<b>Bell (1)</b> 4:2	<b>conference (1)</b> 3:12	<b>Dutchess (2)</b> 4:7,11	<b>fit-ups (1)</b> 6:10
<b>*I* (1)</b> 12:8	<b>Beretta (1)</b> 7:22	<b>consider (2)</b> 8:14;11:2	<b>E</b>	<b>foot (2)</b> 5:5,7
<b>A</b>	<b>bid (1)</b> 5:15	<b>construction (3)</b> 7:10,12;8:24	<b>electrical (1)</b> 6:11	<b>Frances (1)</b> 3:6
<b>able (2)</b> 10:16;11:9	<b>board (4)</b> 7:23;9:22;10:19,25	<b>contractors (1)</b> 10:15	<b>Elmes (1)</b> 3:6	<b>furnishing (1)</b> 9:2
<b>accuracy (1)</b> 9:23	<b>breakdown (1)</b> 7:3	<b>copy (1)</b> 3:24	<b>else (2)</b> 7:9;8:10	<b>further (1)</b> 12:5
<b>acquired (1)</b> 5:11	<b>Brendon (1)</b> 4:4	<b>correction (3)</b> 7:8;8:10,15	<b>e-mail (1)</b> 7:21	<b>G</b>
<b>actually (2)</b> 10:24;11:7	<b>brief (1)</b> 4:17	<b>cost (4)</b> 7:4,12;8:21;10:3	<b>encountered (1)</b> 5:9	<b>gather (1)</b> 11:9
<b>add (3)</b> 5:25;8:3;11:23	<b>bringing (1)</b> 6:2	<b>County (2)</b> 4:7,11	<b>equipment (1)</b> 5:12	<b>guess (1)</b> 11:12
<b>adding (2)</b> 5:5;10:23	<b>building (3)</b> 5:23;8:21;9:6	<b>court (1)</b> 3:7	<b>equipping (1)</b> 9:2	<b>H</b>
<b>additional (6)</b> 5:13,24;8:2,6;9:13;11:10	<b>business (1)</b> 4:25	<b>COVID (1)</b> 7:13	<b>especially (1)</b> 7:12	<b>Hatfield (4)</b> 4:22,23;10:14;11:9
<b>affected (1)</b> 9:25	<b>C</b>	<b>Cricket (1)</b> 5:16	<b>estimate (2)</b> 6:25;7:10	<b>hearing (18)</b> 3:3,4,8,9,11,14,19,21,25;4:8,13,15;7:25;9:10,15;10:9;11:7;12:6
<b>affidavit (2)</b> 3:16,23	<b>calculations (1)</b> 9:24	<b>crisis (1)</b> 7:13	<b>estimates (1)</b> 6:22	<b>held (1)</b> 3:11
<b>again (4)</b> 8:5;9:3,21;11:13	<b>called (1)</b> 5:16	<b>D</b>	<b>evidence (5)</b> 3:5,9,15,22;4:9	<b>higher (1)</b> 6:22
<b>Agency (1)</b> 4:12	<b>can (3)</b> 7:19;9:4;11:22	<b>Dan (1)</b> 11:21	<b>Executive (1)</b> 4:7	<b>Honorable (2)</b> 4:2,6
<b>Alan (1)</b> 4:2	<b>CAPPILLINO (5)</b> 3:2;7:17;10:7;11:20;12:3	<b>Dan's (1)</b> 11:22	<b>exemption (3)</b> 7:7;8:11,13	<b>husband (1)</b> 7:22
<b>allow (2)</b> 5:21,23	<b>carpentry (1)</b> 6:11	<b>dated (2)</b> 9:14,17	<b>Exhibit (4)</b> 3:8,15,22;4:9	<b>I</b>
<b>along (1)</b> 7:24	<b>CATALANO (2)</b> 4:20,21	<b>day (1)</b> 11:8	<b>existing (2)</b> 5:4,8	<b>IDA (2)</b> 5:3,15
<b>always (1)</b> 11:2	<b>Central (1)</b> 4:5	<b>Dean (1)</b> 4:10	<b>expand (1)</b> 5:4	<b>ideal (1)</b> 5:17
<b>amendment (3)</b> 9:12,17,19	<b>Chairman (1)</b> 4:11	<b>detail (1)</b> 7:2	<b>F</b>	<b>improvement (1)</b> 8:24
<b>amount (2)</b> 7:4;10:16	<b>change (1)</b> 10:4	<b>determine (2)</b> 9:25;10:16	<b>Fab (2)</b> 4:22,23	<b>include (1)</b> 6:9
<b>application (4)</b> 6:5,7;8:19;10:18	<b>changed (1)</b> 10:3	<b>determined (1)</b> 10:5	<b>fabrication (2)</b> 4:24;5:13	<b>included (1)</b> 10:18
<b>apply (1)</b> 9:24	<b>changes (2)</b> 10:2,6	<b>Development (1)</b> 4:12	<b>facility (4)</b> 5:4,21;6:2,3	<b>increase (2)</b> 7:6,9
<b>appointing (1)</b> 4:13	<b>checking (1)</b> 11:19	<b>different (1)</b> 9:18	<b>fact (1)</b> 5:18	<b>indicating (3)</b> 3:10,18,24
<b>appropriate (1)</b> 11:3	<b>claim (2)</b> 8:18;9:4	<b>difficulty (1)</b> 5:10	<b>failed (1)</b> 9:15	
<b>Arlington (1)</b>	<b>clarification (1)</b>	<b>District (1)</b> 4:6	<b>familiar (1)</b>	
		<b>document (1)</b>		

<p><b>Industrial (1)</b> 4:12 <b>information (1)</b> 11:10 <b>infrastructure (1)</b> 5:20 <b>installation (1)</b> 9:2 <b>insure (1)</b> 9:22 <b>interior (1)</b> 6:10 <b>items (1)</b> 5:24</p>	<p>6:18;7:3 <b>matter (5)</b> 3:10;4:14;8:3; 10:22;11:3 <b>mean (1)</b> 8:21 <b>meeting (1)</b> 11:17 <b>Members (1)</b> 7:18 <b>Metal (4)</b> 4:22,23,24;6:8 <b>mic (2)</b> 11:13,23 <b>minor (1)</b> 8:14 <b>modification (1)</b> 11:11 <b>Molinaro (1)</b> 4:7 <b>MOORE (1)</b> 11:25 <b>more (5)</b> 5:11;7:8;8:9; 10:14;11:23 <b>Most (1)</b> 5:14</p>	<p><b>onto (2)</b> 5:6,7 <b>open (4)</b> 3:3;4:15;11:13,22 <b>opportunity (1)</b> 7:20 <b>opposed (1)</b> 8:6 <b>original (3)</b> 7:10;8:11,19 <b>otherwise (1)</b> 7:5 <b>Over (3)</b> 5:11;9:8,20</p>	<p><b>Q</b></p> <p><b>questionable (1)</b> 9:11 <b>quotes (1)</b> 10:15</p> <p><b>R</b></p> <p><b>realize (3)</b> 6:6,13,16 <b>realized (1)</b> 6:23 <b>really (2)</b> 7:8;9:20 <b>reason (2)</b> 5:8;6:12 <b>receive (1)</b> 7:21 <b>recently (2)</b> 5:9,14 <b>reconstruction (1)</b> 8:25 <b>record (1)</b> 4:18 <b>reduced (1)</b> 10:17 <b>reducing (1)</b> 10:24 <b>refer (1)</b> 9:11 <b>refers (1)</b> 9:12 <b>relief (2)</b> 5:3;10:13 <b>renovation (1)</b> 8:25 <b>repair (1)</b> 8:25 <b>reporter (1)</b> 3:7 <b>representative (1)</b> 3:17 <b>request (3)</b> 5:2;7:16;10:25 <b>resolution (1)</b> 8:22 <b>revised (1)</b> 6:25 <b>right (1)</b> 3:2</p>	<p>3:6;10:9 <b>September (3)</b> 9:14,19;10:22 <b>served (1)</b> 3:25 <b>shell (2)</b> 8:21;9:6 <b>significantly (2)</b> 6:22;7:14 <b>simply (1)</b> 5:19 <b>site (1)</b> 9:3 <b>sorry (1)</b> 5:6 <b>sought (2)</b> 5:4;10:13 <b>space (1)</b> 5:12 <b>speak (1)</b> 8:5 <b>specifically (1)</b> 8:22 <b>square (1)</b> 5:7 <b>start (1)</b> 7:18 <b>started (1)</b> 6:21 <b>state (1)</b> 9:16 <b>statement (1)</b> 4:17 <b>still (4)</b> 8:16,17;9:4,24 <b>structure (4)</b> 5:5,7,8;6:8 <b>subcontractors (1)</b> 6:14 <b>subsequent (1)</b> 9:16 <b>subtracting (1)</b> 10:24 <b>Superintendent (1)</b> 4:4 <b>Supervisor (1)</b> 4:2</p>
<p><b>J</b></p>	<p><b>N</b></p>	<p><b>P</b></p>		
<p><b>Jenna (1)</b> 3:23 <b>Jim (2)</b> 7:22;11:13 <b>job (3)</b> 5:15,18,20 <b>jobs (4)</b> 5:10,21,25;6:3 <b>Jones (1)</b> 3:24 <b>Journal (1)</b> 3:18</p>	<p><b>name (1)</b> 4:21 <b>nature (1)</b> 6:12 <b>necessary (1)</b> 5:19 <b>needs (1)</b> 10:5 <b>new (2)</b> 5:10,21 <b>Notice (8)</b> 3:9,18,25;9:10,15; 10:8;11:5,6 <b>November (1)</b> 3:12 <b>Number (4)</b> 3:15,22;4:9;6:2 <b>numbers (2)</b> 9:7,18</p>	<p><b>page (1)</b> 4:19 <b>paid (1)</b> 7:6 <b>particular (2)</b> 7:25;8:3 <b>passed (4)</b> 6:15,20;7:23;11:16 <b>paying (2)</b> 4:18;6:15 <b>permanent (2)</b> 5:25;6:3 <b>pilot (3)</b> 9:23;10:4,6 <b>place (2)</b> 9:8,20 <b>point (1)</b> 10:23 <b>positions (1)</b> 6:4 <b>Poughkeepsie (1)</b> 3:17 <b>prior (2)</b> 9:23;10:9 <b>Proceedings (10)</b> 3:1;4:1;5:1;6:1; 7:1;8:1;9:1;10:1; 11:1;12:1 <b>project (7)</b> 4:17;5:17;6:19;8:7, 9;10:2,3 <b>proposal (1)</b> 10:19 <b>provided (2)</b> 11:5,6 <b>providing (1)</b> 6:18 <b>public (14)</b> 3:3,4,9,11,19,25; 4:15;7:18,25;9:10, 15;10:8;11:6;12:6 <b>publication (2)</b> 10:9,10 <b>published (2)</b> 3:19;11:8</p>	<p><b>really (2)</b> 7:8;9:20 <b>reason (2)</b> 5:8;6:12 <b>receive (1)</b> 7:21 <b>recently (2)</b> 5:9,14 <b>reconstruction (1)</b> 8:25 <b>record (1)</b> 4:18 <b>reduced (1)</b> 10:17 <b>reducing (1)</b> 10:24 <b>refer (1)</b> 9:11 <b>refers (1)</b> 9:12 <b>relief (2)</b> 5:3;10:13 <b>renovation (1)</b> 8:25 <b>repair (1)</b> 8:25 <b>reporter (1)</b> 3:7 <b>representative (1)</b> 3:17 <b>request (3)</b> 5:2;7:16;10:25 <b>resolution (1)</b> 8:22 <b>revised (1)</b> 6:25 <b>right (1)</b> 3:2</p>	<p><b>T</b></p> <p><b>taller (1)</b> 5:22 <b>tax (7)</b> 5:3;6:13,17,20;7:5, 7;10:13 <b>Thanks (2)</b> 4:20;11:20 <b>thought (1)</b> 9:5 <b>TIGNANELLI (2)</b> 8:4;11:18 <b>Timothy (1)</b> 4:10</p>
<p><b>L</b></p>	<p><b>N</b></p>	<p><b>P</b></p>		
<p><b>labor (1)</b> 7:3 <b>LaGrange (1)</b> 4:3 <b>less (1)</b> 10:20 <b>letter (6)</b> 4:10;9:12,16,19; 11:15,15 <b>listed (1)</b> 11:22 <b>local (1)</b> 3:13 <b>lot (1)</b> 4:21 <b>Lyons (1)</b> 4:4</p>	<p><b>name (1)</b> 4:21 <b>nature (1)</b> 6:12 <b>necessary (1)</b> 5:19 <b>needs (1)</b> 10:5 <b>new (2)</b> 5:10,21 <b>Notice (8)</b> 3:9,18,25;9:10,15; 10:8;11:5,6 <b>November (1)</b> 3:12 <b>Number (4)</b> 3:15,22;4:9;6:2 <b>numbers (2)</b> 9:7,18</p>	<p><b>proposal (1)</b> 10:19 <b>provided (2)</b> 11:5,6 <b>providing (1)</b> 6:18 <b>public (14)</b> 3:3,4,9,11,19,25; 4:15;7:18,25;9:10, 15;10:8;11:6;12:6 <b>publication (2)</b> 10:9,10 <b>published (2)</b> 3:19;11:8</p>	<p><b>S</b></p> <p><b>sales (6)</b> 6:13,17,20;7:4,6; 10:13 <b>School (1)</b> 4:5 <b>Schools (1)</b> 4:4 <b>sent (2)</b></p>	<p><b>T</b></p> <p><b>taller (1)</b> 5:22 <b>tax (7)</b> 5:3;6:13,17,20;7:5, 7;10:13 <b>Thanks (2)</b> 4:20;11:20 <b>thought (1)</b> 9:5 <b>TIGNANELLI (2)</b> 8:4;11:18 <b>Timothy (1)</b> 4:10</p>
<p><b>M</b></p>	<p><b>O</b></p>	<p><b>P</b></p>		
<p><b>making (1)</b> 7:15 <b>manufacture (1)</b> 5:24 <b>many (2)</b> 4:25,25 <b>Marcus (1)</b> 4:6 <b>marked (5)</b> 3:5,8,14,21;4:8 <b>materials (2)</b></p>	<p><b>obtaining (1)</b> 5:10 <b>October (7)</b> 3:16,20,23;4:10; 7:2;9:17;10:10 <b>officer (1)</b> 4:13 <b>Officer's (4)</b> 3:8,14,21;4:8 <b>only (3)</b> 8:12,19;9:5</p>	<p><b>proposal (1)</b> 10:19 <b>provided (2)</b> 11:5,6 <b>providing (1)</b> 6:18 <b>public (14)</b> 3:3,4,9,11,19,25; 4:15;7:18,25;9:10, 15;10:8;11:6;12:6 <b>publication (2)</b> 10:9,10 <b>published (2)</b> 3:19;11:8</p>	<p><b>S</b></p> <p><b>sales (6)</b> 6:13,17,20;7:4,6; 10:13 <b>School (1)</b> 4:5 <b>Schools (1)</b> 4:4 <b>sent (2)</b></p>	<p><b>T</b></p> <p><b>taller (1)</b> 5:22 <b>tax (7)</b> 5:3;6:13,17,20;7:5, 7;10:13 <b>Thanks (2)</b> 4:20;11:20 <b>thought (1)</b> 9:5 <b>TIGNANELLI (2)</b> 8:4;11:18 <b>Timothy (1)</b> 4:10</p>

<b>total (3)</b> 6:2;10:2,3	3:13 <b>10:33 (1)</b>			
<b>totally (1)</b> 9:18	3:3 <b>12 (1)</b>			
<b>Town (1)</b> 4:3	5:25 <b>13 (1)</b>			
<b>transcript (1)</b> 7:24	10:20 <b>160 (1)</b>			
<b>turn (1)</b> 6:19	8:13 <b>186,000 (1)</b>			
<b>U</b>	10:17			
	<b>2</b>			
<b>unable (1)</b> 5:14	<b>2 (1)</b>			
<b>understand (4)</b> 4:19;7:20;8:17;9:4	3:15 <b>2018 (2)</b>			
<b>un-mute (1)</b> 7:19	5:2;8:22 <b>2020 (8)</b>			
<b>up (2)</b> 5:12;7:13	3:12,20,23;4:10; 7:2;9:14,17,19			
<b>upon (3)</b> 3:25;4:3,6	<b>23 (1)</b> 4:10			
<b>V</b>	<b>26 (1)</b> 3:23			
<b>Valley (1)</b> 5:16	<b>27 (1)</b> 3:20			
<b>value (1)</b> 10:2	<b>27th (3)</b> 3:16;10:10;11:8			
<b>Vincent (2)</b> 4:16,21	<b>28 (4)</b> 7:2;9:14,17,19			
<b>W</b>	<b>28th (1)</b> 10:22			
	<b>3</b>			
<b>wants (1)</b> 11:23	<b>3 (1)</b>			
<b>words (1)</b> 8:20	3:22 <b>30,000-square (1)</b>			
<b>work (1)</b> 6:11	5:5			
<b>working (1)</b> 10:11	<b>4</b>			
<b>wrote (1)</b> 11:15	<b>4 (1)</b> 4:9			
<b>Y</b>	<b>5</b>			
<b>years (2)</b> 4:25;5:11	<b>50,000-square (1)</b> 5:7			
<b>Z</b>	<b>6</b>			
<b>Zoom (1)</b> 3:11	<b>64 (1)</b> 6:3			
<b>1</b>				
<b>1 (1)</b> 3:8				
<b>10 (1)</b> 3:12				
<b>10:30 (1)</b>				



## Sarah Lee

---

**From:** Jim Beretta <jimberetta@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 09, 2020 6:30 PM  
**To:** Sarah Lee  
**Subject:** Public hearing comments, Hatfield Properties, LLC and Hatfield Metal Fab, Inc.,

I wish to submit the following public comment for the November 10, 2020 DCIDA public hearing for the additional financial assistance request for Hatfield Properties, LLC and Hatfield Metal Fab, Inc.

As per the meeting notice:

"A prior public hearing was held for the Facility on April 16, 2018, after which the Agency's Board members approved the Project by resolution dated October 16, 2018. The Corporation submitted a letter amendment to its application dated September 28, 2020 requesting the Agency provide additional financial assistance with respect to the Facility in the form of sales and use tax exemptions in excess of the amounts previously approved by the Agency (the "Additional Benefits"). "

I am opposed to the expansion of financial assistance requested for this project.

1. This represents scope creep in the original allocation of financial assistance in 2018. Also, since 2018, we are now faced with a COVID-19 economy that has caused revenue loss to the county and towns. Tax burden from this project should not be getting transferred to other residents.
2. There is no business case provided that demonstrates that this project is not economically feasible without additional financial assistance.
3. When development projects don't pay their taxes the burden is shifted to other taxpayers. Especially during this time of the COVID-19 pandemic, governments and municipalities have gaps in their budgets and absolving some from paying taxes is antithetical to the gaps in municipal budgets and fairness for all other taxpayers.
4. Millions of people in the country are facing unemployment and the lack of ability to put food on the table for their family. All taxes should be collected from for-profit, non-tax-exempt projects.
6. Right here in the Hudson Valley, a recent article in the Poughkeepsie Journal pointed out that **"38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet"**. I reference that article below:

Poughkeepsie Journal article by Ryan Santistvan, August 12, 2020.

### **"ALICE report shows 38% of Hudson Valley households struggle to make ends meet"**

" Amid the COVID-19 pandemic, unemployment across the region and state has soared. But even before that, roughly 38% of Hudson Valley households and 45% of households across the state were not making enough money to cover their basic needs, according to the United Way of New York. And, those numbers were disproportionately higher when looking only at black and hispanic households.

7. Dutchess County is experiencing financial budget gaps due to the COVID-19 pandemic, having to furlough employees, offer early retirement and take other spending cuts to try and meet the financial challenge. The County can ill afford to be providing tax exemptions. As quoted in the following referenced article, Dutchess County is at the top of the list, "statewide", for sales tax loss, so far, in 2020 and the County Executive "was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic."

Rockland/Westchester Journal News, May 12, 2020, David McKay Wilson

"Dutchess County had the biggest year-to-year sales tax decline statewide in March, with a loss of 17%, as popular restaurants shifted to take-out, and tourists stayed home. April was even worse, with sales taxes revenue down 27%. For the first four months of 2020, Dutchess sales tax receipts are down \$4.5 million, or 7%. Last month, Dutchess County Executive Marc Molinaro said the county was projecting 50% less revenue in sales tax this year amid the pandemic. The restoration "I daresay, is going to last through the duration of 2020," he said. "

Again, I am opposed to the additional benefits being requested.

Jim Beretta  
Poughkeepsie  
845-392-6252

## Sarah Lee

---

**From:** Doreen Tignanelli <doreentig@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 10, 2020 8:28 AM  
**To:** Sarah Lee  
**Subject:** Public Comment, Hatfield Properties, Nov. 10, 2020 DCIDA hearing

Ms. Lee, please include my comments as part of the official public record for the 10:30 am November 10, 2020 DCIDA Public Hearing regarding Hatfield Properties/Hatfield Metal project and share these comments with the DCIDA Chair and Board members.

1) The Notice of Public Hearing for Hatfield Properties/Hatfield Metal is called into question as the Notice refers to an letter amendment requesting additional financial assistance dated September 28, 2020 but fails to state there was a subsequent letter amendment dated October 28, 2020.

The October 28, 2020 letter amendment contains different numbers than the September 28, 2020 letter amendment for estimated cost of work as well as equipment and materials cost subject to sales tax exemption.

2) I am opposed to the issuance of "Financial Assistance" and/or "Additional Benefits" to the Hatfield Properties/Hatfield Metal Project in any form including, but not limited to, Mortgage Tax Exemption, Sales Tax Exemption and Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILOT).

After receiving final IDA approval on October 24, 2018 for a PILOT and Sales Tax Exemption to expand their currently facility, Hatfield claims they just "*recently became aware*" that their "*original application only had the 'shell' of the building cost*". As a result, they are seeking an amendment to their taxable equipment/materials cost which would increase their sales tax exemption.

It is unclear how it can be claimed that only the "shell of the building cost" was used in 2018 as the DCIDA final resolution stated financial assistance was for "*the construction, improvement, reconstruction, repair, renovation, installation, furnishing and equipping of an approximately 30,000 square foot addition*".

Per the 2018 final resolution, the exemption for sales and use taxes was not to exceed \$16,250. Their amended application now estimates a sales tax exemption of \$186,542.

3) The Board should ensure the accuracy of prior PILOT calculations and determine if they are affected by the changes, including but not limited to project cost and project value.

Doreen Tignanelli  
29 Colburn Drive  
Poughkeepsie NY 12603

